

**What does excellent external moderation
look like and how does it support work
integrated learning?**

A new approach to quality assurance

Presenters and researchers

1. Lester Hoare – General Manager Quality Assurance and Enhancement, Muka Tangata
2. Marianne Farrell – Quality Assurance and Enhancement Team Lead, Muka Tangata
3. Dave Marr – Project Lead and Researcher, SAARA
4. Kīngi Rākete-Tane - Poutiaki Te Ara Kounga Māori, Muka Tangata


Muka Tangata: who are we & what do we do?


- One of six Workforce Development Councils (WDCs)
- Muka Tangata supports the food and fibre sector
- We want industries and learners to get the skills they need
- We are driven by legislation

‘We want to support providers to develop and deliver high quality programmes’

\$52.2 Billion


Food and fibre accounts for 11.1% of GDP in the year to 31 March 2020, 81.8% of trade in the year to 31 March 2022, forecast \$52.2 billion in export revenue in the year to 30 June 2022.




 **9%** Revenue forecast to increase 9% in 2022 despite COVID-19 immigration restrictions and supply chain issues.


 Māori have substantial assets: \$23.4 billion in 2018 (an increase of \$12 billion since 2013).


 **367,000 people**
367,000 people: 13.8% of all employment in New Zealand.


    **Self-employed**
Around a quarter are self-employed – but a trend towards larger businesses with greater numbers of employees.

 **17%** **Māori workforce**
Ethnic diversity is increasing and Māori are a significant and growing group of employees (17% increase in the Māori workforce, 2016-2019).

   Migrant workers are significant in key parts of the sector, such as horticulture and seafood.


 Women tend to be under-represented.

 Industries highlight skills gaps, but vocational education data is limited (focused primarily on formal industry training and qualifications).

 Multiple training pathways: increasing number of people have formal qualifications, but a lot of training is informal and not associated with a formal qualification.

 **Enrolment in formal industry drop in 2015-2020**
The number of people enrolled in formal industry training has dropped in many industry segments (2015-2020) – take up of apprenticeships is low compared to other sectors.

There may be gaps in some demographic groups, such as Pacific peoples and women, taking up vocational education.

 Rapidly changing skills requirements due to: new technologies (both digital and agritech); strategies being put in place to address climate change; the move to a low emissions economy; and the challenges of becoming more environmentally and socially sustainable.

Work-based learning – comes with challenges

- 3-way contract (learner, provider, employer)
- Many programmes incorporate off-job leaning; and
- Most learning and assessment occurs in the workplace
- Learning and assessment is complex
- Assessors will have different levels of knowledge and experience

WDC QA activities include;

- Consent to assess standards
- Pre-assessment moderation
- Post-assessment moderation
- Programme endorsement
- Contribute to a VET system that;
 - honours te Tiriti o Waitangi
 - helps meet the needs and aspirations of priority learners; and
 - enables us to work collaboratively with providers to support learner success

The research:

The [External Moderation Review](#) – independent review of quality assurance and moderation practices. Conducted by SAARA.

‘The focus of the review was to confirm the value of external moderation with partners, explore opportunities for improvement, identify opportunities to be better connected with Māori and Te Tiriti o Waitangi through moderation, and research best practice and innovation allowing for flexibility with the evolving VET environment’.

SAARA – the external moderation review

SAARA was contracted in March 2022 to review Muka Tangata moderation systems so that Muka Tangata can develop fit-for-the-future National Moderation Plans

Four project phases:

1. **Research** national and international external moderation best practice
2. **Survey** partners on current knowledge and understanding of external moderation specific to the food and fibre sector
3. **Interview** survey participants regarding current and future external moderation specific to the Food and Fibre Sector
4. **Workshop** with new partners on survey and interview key findings

1. Research

Both national and international educational organisations were reviewed:

- VET Moderation Principles 2001
- NZQA (New Zealand Qualifications Authority)
- Transitional Industry Training Organisations (TITOs)
- TKI – Te Kete Ipurangi (Ministry of Education)
- NZCER – Council for Education Research
- ASQA – Australian Skills Quality Authority
- Education State, Victoria State Government

1. Research continued

- VDC – VET Development Centre (Australia)
- EQAVET – European Quality Assurance in Vocational Education and Training
- Cedefop – European Centre for the Development of Vocational Training
- ENQA – The European Association for Quality Assurance in Higher Education
- QQI – Quality and Qualifications Ireland
- Skills Future (Singapore)
- Institute for Adult Learning Singapore (IAL)

2. Survey

- The purpose of the digital survey was to capture current knowledge and opinions from partners on external moderation prior to individual interviews
- 37 respondents from four partner groups – learners, providers, industry and public sector covering
- Respondents were asked a number of questions around their understanding of external moderation, its importance, their experiences with it, and the rating of different tools

“The processes are well considered and clear however they have tended toward audit approach, with minimal feedback provided that could better support continual improvement.” (Provider comment)

3. Interviews

- Interviews were conducted to gain further partner perspective, provide feedback and recommendations on potential future external moderation practices and procedures
- A total of 34 partners were interviewed, following on from the partner survey with 37 respondents; 18 were from industry, 2 ākonga, 12 providers and 2 public sector
- The Interviews were held online and one-on-one, with each interview scheduled for 45 minutes. They ranged from 30 to 90 minutes in duration
- They focused on four key areas; meaning of moderation, value of moderation, focus of moderation, and moderation processes

“From my experience, often where an assessment is made... how do you ensure consistency, fair play, not skewed either end by individuals.”

4. Online workshops with partners

- Partners from providers, industry and Māori secondary and tertiary education were invited to participate in the external moderation online workshops to discuss a draft of potential external moderation model and tools.
- Of the 92 organisations contacted, 21 partners from providers and 5 from industry accepted
- Five workshops were conducted of 90 minute duration
- Four key areas were discussed with guided questions and prompts for each; collaboration, holistic quality assurance, guidance and support, and educational improvement
 - Strong approval in all the workshops from providers and industry for guidance and support, with many providers seeing the benefit of the independent WDC relationship to help them improve their programmes and performance
 - Both industry and providers were keen for support in educational improvement, particularly with tools to address priority learners and the needs of ākonga Māori.

Key findings

- Partners (industry, providers, learners) value external moderation
- The needs of ākonga Māori in programme development, assessment and moderation are recognised as very important by but not well understood
- Providers want cluster workshops and professional development opportunities
- Providers and industry want moderation to focus on the whole programme
- A systematic approach to moderation was supported by several providers and industry, rather than getting too granular and pedantic
- Providers don't want to see overlap between NZQA and WDCs functions

Key findings continued

- Industry felt strongly that moderation ensures training is robust, and improves provider materials and practices
- A risk-based approach for moderation was important to industry, with time and resources to support those needing it, while continuing to work with high performers
- Regular engagement and check-ins rated highly with providers and the importance of building authentic relations
- WDCs should collaborate with each other on quality assurance and moderation practices and systems to support consistency for providers

SAARA – the external moderation review

Key recommendations:

- Improve Māori participation
- Upskill partners through education and guidance
- Strengthen consistency
- Collaborate for success
- Build a quality assurance culture

Te Whakatōnga

Muka Tangata undertook this review to develop an approach to QA that incorporates and values te ao Māori and mātauranga Māori.

Key findings:

- Māori learners look at success holistically
- Māori learner needs are met when there are common tikanga, reo and values in place that are practiced and upheld daily
- Pastoral care is a collective duty not its own standalone function
- Tutors and organisations are at different levels of their te ao Māori journeys

Te Whakatōnga

Key recommendations:

- Have a te ao Māori approach to quality assurance
- Have Māori as a moderation focus area
- Champion successful Māori models
- Mātauranga Māori approaches are supported with professional development
- This mahi will support others mahi – providers, Ohu Ahumahi, and the Food & Fibre CoVE

Incorporating the research into Muka Tangata approaches to QA

For our planning:

- We have made the recommendations into actions
- We are developing rubrics to support WDCs when evaluating programme endorsement considerations
- We are focusing moderation at a programme level
- We are focusing on Māori learner achievement
- We are using moderation tools that move the needle
- We are building internal capability around te ao Māori
- We are using better metrics to inform decision making around risk, programme performance and learner progression

To better support providers:

- We will continue our whanaungatanga approach
- We will focus on building strong relationships, support and collaboration with providers and schools through regular engagement
- We will visit providers more and incorporate more effective moderation tools
- We are available to support provider programme development working groups around WDC considerations
- We will continue to discuss moderation results and recommendations
- We will facilitate ongoing professional development workshops for providers – 22 online in 2023

Pātai | Questions

